

October 24, 2022

**BY ECF**

The Honorable Lewis J. Liman  
United States District Court  
Southern District of New York  
Daniel Patrick Moynihan  
United States Courthouse  
500 Pearl Street  
New York, NY 10007

The proposed agenda submitted by the parties for oral argument on November 3, 2022 at 9:30 a.m. is approved. 10 minutes of the 25 minutes allotted per side for argument on End-Payor Plaintiffs' Second Consolidated Amended Complaint will be dedicated to Nonresident Defendants' Rule 12(b)(2) Motion to Dismiss End-Payor Plaintiffs' Non-New York Claims for Lack of Personal Jurisdiction, Dkt. No. 386.

10-25-22.



LEWIS J. LIMAN  
United States District Judge

**Re: *In re Bystolic Antitrust Litig.*, Case No. 1:20-cv-05735 (LJL)**

Dear Judge Liman:

As directed by the Court's October 13, 2022 Order (ECF No. 431), the parties have conferred and jointly provide the following proposed agenda for the argument on November 3, 2022 at 9:30 a.m. regarding Defendants' pending motions to dismiss:

**1. Defendants' Motion to Dismiss the Direct Purchaser and Retailer Plaintiffs' Third Consolidated Amended Complaint (ECF No. 393)**

75 minutes per side (movant permitted to divide between opening and rebuttal)

**2. Comfort Break**

10 minutes

**3. Defendants' Motions to Dismiss the End-Payor Plaintiffs' Second Consolidated Amended Complaint**

25 minutes per side (movant permitted to divide between opening and rebuttal)

The parties plan to address the statute of limitations issue raised in Defendants' Motion to Dismiss the End-Payor Plaintiffs' Second Consolidated Amended Complaint (ECF No. 397), and plan to rest on their papers as to the remaining issues raised in Defendants' motion. However, if the Court has questions as to these issues, the parties will be prepared to address them.

The parties were unclear whether the reference to "motions" (plural) in the Court's October 13 Order means that the Court is also seeking argument on the Nonresident Defendants' Rule 12(b)(2) Motion to Dismiss End-Payor Plaintiffs' Non-New York Claims for Lack of Personal Jurisdiction (ECF No. 386). Defendants believe argument on the Rule 12(b)(2) motion would be helpful as the jurisdictional arguments have evolved since earlier briefing. End-Payor Plaintiffs will be prepared to address the jurisdictional motion if the Court wants to hear argument on it, but believe that the motion can be decided on the papers. To the extent the Court wants to hear argument on this motion, the parties will be prepared to allocate 10 minutes

per side, of the total 25 minutes allocated to the End-Payor-specific issues, to this motion. However, the parties would appreciate further guidance from the Court as to whether it wants to hear argument on the jurisdictional issues.

Consistent with the Court's October 13 Order, the parties do not intend to present argument with respect to Defendant Teva Pharmaceutical Industries Ltd.'s Motion to Dismiss the February 2022 Complaints Under Rule 12(b)(2) (ECF No. 388). The parties also welcome any guidance if the Court wishes to hear argument or has questions on specific issues.

Respectfully submitted,

/s/ Kimberly M. Hennings

Bruce E. Gerstein  
Kimberly M. Hennings  
**GARWIN GERSTEIN & FISHER LLP**  
88 Pine Street, 10th Floor  
New York, NY 10005  
Tel.: (212) 398-0055  
Fax: (212) 764-6620  
bgerstein@garwingerstein.com  
khennings@garwingerstein.com

/s/ Caitlin G. Coslett

David F. Sorensen (*pro hac vice*)  
Caitlin G. Coslett (*pro hac vice*)  
**BERGER MONTAGUE PC**  
1818 Market Street, Suite 3600  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
(215) 875-3000  
dsorensen@bm.net  
ccoslett@bm.net

*Counsel for Plaintiff J M Smith Corporation d/b/a Smith Drug Company and interim co-lead counsel for the Direct Purchaser Class*

/s/ Scott E. Perwin

Scott E. Perwin (*pro hac vice*)  
Lauren C. Ravkind (*pro hac vice*)  
Anna T. Neill (*pro hac vice*)  
**KENNY NACHWALTER P.A.**  
Four Seasons Tower  
1441 Brickell Avenue  
Suite 1100

/s/ Robin A. van der Meulen

Robin A. van der Meulen  
Gregory S. Asciolla  
Matthew J. Perez  
Veronica Bosco  
**DICELLO LEVITT LLC**  
485 Lexington Avenue, Suite 1001  
New York, NY 10017  
Tel: (646) 933-1000  
Fax: (646) 494-9648  
rvandermeulen@dicellosevitt.com  
gasciolla@ dicellosevitt.com  
mperez@ dicellosevitt.com  
vbosco@ dicellosevitt.com

/s/ Sharon K. Robertson

Sharon K. Robertson  
Donna M. Evans (*pro hac vice*)  
**COHEN MILSTEIN SELLERS & TOLL PLLC**  
88 Pine Street, 14th Floor  
New York, NY 10005  
Tel: (212) 838-7797  
Fax: (212) 838-7745  
srobertson@cohenmilstein.com  
devans@cohenmilstein.com

Robert A. Braun

**COHEN MILSTEIN SELLERS & TOLL PLLC**  
1100 New York Avenue, NW  
Fifth Floor  
Washington, D.C. 20005

Miami, FL 33131  
(305) 373-1000  
sperwin@knpa.com  
lravkind@knpa.com  
aneill@knpa.com

*Counsel for Plaintiffs Walgreen Co., The Kroger Co., Albertsons Companies, Inc. and H-E-B, L.P.*

/s/ J. Mark Gidley

J. Mark Gidley  
Peter J. Carney (pro hac vice)  
Eric Grannon (pro hac vice)  
Adam Acosta (pro hac vice)  
Celia McLaughlin (pro hac vice)  
Holly Letourneau (pro hac vice)  
Kelly Newman  
**WHITE & CASE LLP**  
701 Thirteenth Street, NW  
Washington, DC 20005-38007  
Tel: (202) 626-3600  
Fax: (212) 354-8113  
mgidley@whitecase.com  
pcarney@whitecase.com  
egrannon@whitecase.com  
adam.acosta@whitecase.com  
cmclaughlin@whitecase.com  
hletourneau@whitecase.com  
kelly.newman@whitecase.com

*Counsel for AbbVie, Inc., Allergan Inc., Allergan Sales LLC, Allergan USA, Inc. Forest Laboratories Inc., Forest Laboratories Holdings Ltd., Forest Laboratories Ireland, LTD., Watson Pharmaceuticals Inc. (later known as Actavis, Inc.)*

/s/ Devora W. Allon  
Devora W. Allon, P.C.  
**KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**  
601 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
Tel: (212) 446-5697  
Fax: (212) 446-6460  
devora.allon@kirkland.com

Jay P. Lefkowitz, P.C.  
**KIRKLAND & ELLIS LLP**

Tel: (202) 408-4600  
[rbraun@cohenmilstein.com](mailto:rbraun@cohenmilstein.com)

*Co-Lead Counsel for the Proposed End-Payor Class*

/s/ Alexander J. Egerváry

Alexander J. Egerváry  
Barry L. Refsin (pro hac vice)  
Chelsea M. Nichols (pro hac vice)  
Caitlin V. McHugh (pro hac vice)  
**HANGLEY ARONCHICK**  
**SEGAL PUDLIN & SCHILLER**  
One Logan Square, 27th Floor  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
(215) 568-6200  
[aegervary@hangley.com](mailto:aegervary@hangley.com)  
[brefsin@hangley.com](mailto:brefsin@hangley.com)  
[cnichols@hangley.com](mailto:cnichols@hangley.com)  
[cmchugh@hangley.com](mailto:cmchugh@hangley.com)

Monica L. Kiley (pro hac vice)

Eric L. Bloom (pro hac vice)

**HANGLEY ARONCHICK**

**SEGAL**  
**PUDLIN & SCHILLER**  
2805 Old Post Road, Suite 100  
Harrisburg, PA 17110-3676  
(717) 364-1030  
[mkiley@hangley.com](mailto:mkiley@hangley.com)  
[ebloom@hangley.com](mailto:ebloom@hangley.com)

*Counsel for Plaintiffs CVS Pharmacy, Inc., Rite Aid Corporation and Rite Aid Hdqtrs. Corp.*

/s/ Christopher T. Holding

Christopher T. Holding (pro hac vice)  
**GOODWIN PROCTER LLP**  
100 Northern Avenue  
Boston, MA 02210  
Tel: (617) 570-1753  
Fax: (617) 523-1231  
[cholding@goodwinlaw.com](mailto:cholding@goodwinlaw.com)

*Counsel for Watson Pharma, Inc. (n/k/a Actavis Pharma, Inc.), Watson*

601 Lexington Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
Tel: (212) 446-4970  
Fax: (212) 446-4900  
lefkowitz@kirkland.com

*Counsel for Torrent Pharma, Inc.*

/s/ Ahmed M.T. Riaz

Ahmed M.T. Riaz  
**ARENTFOX SCHIFF LLP**  
1185 Avenue of the Americas  
Suite 3000  
New York, NY 10036  
(212) 753-5000  
Ahmed.riaz@afslaw.com

Suzanne L. Wahl (pro hac vice)  
**ARENTFOX SCHIFF LLP**  
350 S. Main St., Suite 210  
Ann Arbor, MI 48104  
(734)-222-1500  
Suzanne.wahl@afslaw.com

*Counsel for Indchemie Health Specialties Private Ltd.,  
Alkem Laboratories Ltd., Ascend Laboratories LLC*

/s/ Eileen M. Cole

Eileen M. Cole  
John "Jay" Jurata, Jr. (pro hac vice)  
James Tierney (pro hac vice)  
**ORRICK, HERRINGTON & SUTCLIFFE LLP**  
Columbia Center  
1152 15th Street, N.W.  
Washington, DC 20005-1706  
Tel: (202) 339 8400  
Fax: (202) 339 8500  
eileen.cole@orrick.com  
jjurata@orrick.com  
jtierney@orrick.com

*Counsel for Defendant ANI Pharmaceuticals, Inc.*

/s/ Tobias Snyder

Tobias Snyder  
Marc Lewis  
Newton Oldfather

*Laboratories, Inc. (NV), Watson  
Laboratories, Inc. (DE) (n/k/a  
Actavis Laboratories UT, Inc.),  
Watson Laboratories, Inc. (NY) (later  
known as Actavis Laboratories NY,  
Inc.), Watson Laboratories, Inc.,  
(CT), Teva Pharmaceutical Industries  
Ltd., Teva Pharmaceuticals USA, Inc.*

/s/ Teresa T. Bonder

Teresa T. Bonder (pro hac vice)  
**ALSTON & BIRD, LLP**  
560 Mission Street, Ste. 2100  
San Francisco, CA 94105  
Tel: (415)-243-1000  
Fax: (415)-243-1001  
teresa.bonder@alston.com

Matthew D. Kent (pro hac vice)  
Andrew Hatchett (pro hac vice)  
**ALSTON & BIRD, LLP**  
1201 W. Peachtree Street  
Atlanta, GA 30309  
Tel: (404) 881-7000  
Fax: (404) 881-7777  
matthew.kent@alston.com  
andrew.hatchett@alston.com

Natalie Christine Clayton  
**ALSTON & BIRD, LLP**  
90 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10016  
Tel: (212) 210-9573  
Fax: (212) 922-3845  
natalie.clayton@alston.com

*Counsel for Glenmark Generics, Inc.,  
USA n/k/a Glenmark Pharmaceuticals  
Inc., Glenmark Generics Ltd., and  
Glenmark Pharmaceuticals Ltd.*

/s/ Jonathan D. Janow

Jonathan D. Janow  
**BUCHANAN INGERSOLL &  
ROONEY PC**  
1700 K Street, N.W., Suite 300  
Washington, DC 20006-3807

**LEWIS & LLEWELLYN LLP**  
601 Montgomery Street, Suite 2000  
San Francisco, CA 94111  
Tel: (415) 800-0590  
Fax: (415) 390-2127  
[tsnyder@lewisllewellyn.com](mailto:tsnyder@lewisllewellyn.com)  
[mlewis@lewisllewellyn.com](mailto:mlewis@lewisllewellyn.com)  
[noldfather@lewisllewellyn.com](mailto:noldfather@lewisllewellyn.com)

*Counsel for Defendants Amerigen Pharmaceuticals Ltd.  
and Amerigen Pharmaceuticals Inc.*

Tel: (202) 452-6057  
Fax: (202) 452-7989  
[jonathan.janow@bipc.com](mailto:jonathan.janow@bipc.com)

Abigail F. Coster  
**BUCHANAN INGERSOLL &  
ROONEY PC**  
640 5th Avenue, 9th Floor  
New York, NY 10019-6102  
Tel: (212) 440-4419  
Fax: (212) 440-4401  
[abigail.coster@bipc.com](mailto:abigail.coster@bipc.com)

*Counsel for Defendants Hetero  
Labs Ltd., Hetero Drugs Ltd., and  
Hetero USA Inc.*